

Here's looking at you...



Geoff Huston

The Theory

- We use Google Ads to deliver a test script to a very large profile of users
 - We measure the DNS, DNSSEC, IPv6, performance, and many other aspects of the end user's view of the Internet
 - We have some 500,000 ads delivered per day
 - And each of them use uniquely generated URLs
 - So, in theory we should see each unique URL retrieved once
 - Right?

Here is what we see in the web logs...

```
[22/Jan/2014:00:10:21 +0000]  
120.194.53.xxx  
"GET /1x1.png?  
t10000.u3697062917.s1390349413.i333.v1794.rd.td  
[22/Jan/2014:00:11:29 +0000]  
221.176.4.xxx  
"GET /1x1.png?  
t10000.u3697062917.s1390349413.i333.v1794.rd.td
```

68 seconds later:

-- SAME URL

-- 120.194.53.xxx – Origin AS = 24445

-- 221.176.4.xxx – Origin AS = 9808

How widespread is this?

48 days in 2013:

- 29,171,864 unique URLs presented to end users
- 612,089 of these URLs were re-presented to us from a different client IP address

That's 2.1% of URLs fetches that seem to have attracted a digital stalker!

The Top Repeaters

Rank	IP Address	Count	AS	AS Name
1	119.147.146.xxx	11,241	4134	CHINANET-BACKBONE No.31,Jin-rong Street CN
2	182.18.208.xxx	1,0982	23944	SKYBB-AS-AP AS-SKYBroadband SKYCable Corporation PH
3	182.18.209.xxx	5,046	23944	SKYBB-AS-AP AS-SKYBroadband SKYCable Corporation PH
4	124.6.181.xxx	5,046	4775	GLOBE-TELECOM-AS Globe Telecoms PH
5	112.198.64.xxx	4,641	4775	GLOBE-TELECOM-AS Globe Telecoms PH
6	203.177.74.xxx	3,315	4775	GLOBE-TELECOM-AS Globe Telecoms PH
7	120.28.64.xxx	3,230	4775	GLOBE-TELECOM-AS Globe Telecoms PH
8	211.125.138.xxx	3,098	9619	SSD Sony Global Solutions Inc. JP
9	210.94.41.xxx	1,414	6619	SAMUNGSDS-AS-KR SamsungSDS Inc. KR
10	222.127.223.xxx	1,269	4775	GLOBE-TELECOM-AS Globe Telecoms PH
11	210.143.35.xxx	1,177	2516	KDDI KDDI CORPORATION JP
12	202.156.10.xxx	1,154	10091	SCV-AS-AP StarHub Cable Vision Ltd SG
13	14.1.193.xxx	1,128	45960	YTLCOMMS-AS-AP YTL COMMUNICATIONS SDN BHD MY
14	183.90.103.xxx	1,069	55430	STARHUBINTERNET-AS-NGNBN Starhub Internet Pte Ltd SG
15	202.246.252.xxx	995	2526	HITNET HITACHI,Ltd. Information Technology Division. JP
16	192.51.44.xxx	887	2510	INFOWEB FUJITSU LIMITED JP
17	183.90.41.xxx	774	55430	STARHUBINTERNET-AS-NGNBN Starhub Internet Pte Ltd SG
18	110.34.0.xxx	704	4007	Subisu Cablenet (Pvt) Ltd, Baluwatar, Kathmandu, Nepal NP
19	110.232.92.xxx	638	23679	NUSANET-AS-ID Media Antar Nusa PT. ID
20	37.19.108.xxx	603	44143	VIPMOBILE-AS Vip mobile d.o.o. RS
21	24.186.96.xxx	573	6128	CABLE-NET-1 - Cablevision Systems Corp. US
22	161.53.179.xxx	535	2108	CARNET-AS Croatian Academic and Research Network HR
23	193.254.230.xxx	534	25304	UNITBV Universitatea TRANSILVANIA Brasov RO
24	121.54.54.xxx	500	10139	SMARTBRO-PH-AP Smart Broadband, Inc. PH
25	77.244.114.xxx	484	42779	AZERFON Azerfon AS AZ

Web Proxies?

- A strong indicator of a proxy device is that it is located in the same AS as the end client.
- So lets filter that list and look at those repeaters that use a different AS from the original request
- And here's what we see

Different Origin AS Repeaters

Rank	IP Address	Count	AS	AS Name
1	119.147.146.xxx	8,886	4134	CHINANET-BACKBONE No.31,Jin-rong Street CN
2	220.181.158.xxx	493	23724	CHINANET-IDC-BJ IDC, China Telecommunications Corporation CN
3	123.125.161.xxx	446	4808	CHINA169-BJ CNCGROUP IP China169 Beijing Province Network CN
4	210.133.104.xxx	285	7677	DNP Dai Nippon Printing Co., Ltd JP
5	202.214.150.xxx	266	2497	IIJ Internet Initiative Japan Inc. JP
6	112.65.211.xxx	248	17621	CNCGROUP-SH China Unicom Shanghai network CN
7	221.176.4.xxx	226	9808	CMNET-GD Guangdong Mobile Communication Co.Ltd. CN
8	62.84.94.xxx	204	16130	FiberLink Networks LB
9	212.40.141.xxx	203	31126	SODETEL-AS SODETEL SAL LB
10	101.69.163.xxx	163	4837	CHINA169-BACKBONE CNCGROUP China169 Backbone CN
11	59.162.23.xxx	158	4755	TATACOMM-AS TATA Communications IN
12	8.35.201.xxx	156	15169	GOOGLE - Google Inc. US
13	118.186.36.xxx	149	23724	CHINANET-IDC-BJ IDC, China Telecommunications Corporation CN
14	190.96.112.xxx	147	262150	Empresa Provincial de Energia de Cordoba AR
15	202.155.113.xxx	143	4795	INDOSATM2-ID INDOSATM2 ASN ID
16	118.228.151.xxx	142	4538	ERX-CERNET-BKB China Education and Research Network Center CN
17	123.125.73.xxx	136	4808	CHINA169-BJ CNCGROUP IP China169 Beijing Province Network CN
18	69.41.14.xxx	133	47018	CE-BGPAC - Covenant Eyes, Inc. US
19	118.97.198.xxx	131	17974	TELKOMNET-AS2-AP PT Telekomunikasi Indonesia ID
20	112.215.11.xxx	128	17885	JKTXLNET-AS-AP PT Excelcomindo Pratama ID
21	122.2.0.xxx	125	9299	IPG-AS-AP Philippine Long Distance Telephone Company PH
22	176.28.78.xxx	123	197893	ELSUHD-AS Elsuhd Net Ltd. Communications and Computer Services IQ
23	14.139.97.xxx	120	55824	RSMANI-NKN-AS-AP National Knowledge Network IN
24	211.155.120.xxx	116	23724	CHINANET-IDC-BJ IDC, China Telecommunications Corporation CN
25	121.96.61.xxx	114	6648	BAYAN Bayan Telecommunications, Inc. PH

Maybe its National Infrastructure

- We've all heard about the Great Firewall of China
- And other countries may be doing similar things
- So perhaps these repeaters are the result of some form of national / regional content cache program
- So lets filter this further by using geolocate information to find those cases where the original end client and the digital stalker locate to different countries

Different Country Stalkers

Rank	IP Address	Count	AS	AS Name
1	119.147.146.xxx	7,001	4134	CHINANET-BACKBONE No.31,Jin-rong Street CN
2	8.35.201.xxx	156	15169	GOOGLE - Google Inc. US
3	190.216.130.xxx	84	3549	GBLX Global Crossing Ltd. AR
4	190.27.253.xxx	82	19429	ETB - Colombia CO
5	61.92.16.xxx	62	9269	HKBN-AS-AP Hong Kong Broadband Network Ltd. HK
6	208.80.194.xxx	53	13448	WEBSense Websense, Inc. US
7	112.140.187.xxx	33	45634	SPARKSTATION-SG-AP 10 Science Park Road SG
8	69.41.14.xxx	32	47018	CE-BGPAC - Covenant Eyes, Inc. US
9	126.117.225.xxx	31	17676	GIGAINFRA Softbank BB Corp. JP
10	113.43.175.xxx	29	17506	UCOM UCOM Corp. JP
11	202.249.25.xxx	26	4717	AI3 WIDE Project JP
12	139.193.204.xxx	25	23700	BM-AS-ID PT. Broadband Multimedia, Tbk ID
13	180.13.45.xxx	22	4713	OCN NTT Communications Corporation JP
14	201.221.124.xxx	21	27989	BANCOLOMBIA S.A CO
15	123.125.161.xxx	21	4808	CHINA169-BJ CNCGROUP China169 Beijing Province Network CN
16	220.181.158.xxx	17	23724	CHINANET-IDC-BJ IDC, China Telecommunications Corporation CN
17	208.184.77.xxx	17	6461	MFNX MFN - Metromedia Fiber Network US
18	183.179.254.xxx	16	9269	HKBN-AS-AP Hong Kong Broadband Network Ltd. HK
19	203.192.154.xxx	16	10026	PACNET Pacnet Global Ltd JP
20	139.193.223.xxx	13	23700	BM-AS-ID PT. Broadband Multimedia, Tbk ID
21	175.134.140.xxx	12	2516	KDDI KDDI CORPORATION JP
22	210.187.58.xxx	12	4788	TMNET-AS-AP TM Net, Internet Service Provider MY
23	195.93.102.xxx	12	1668	AOL-ATDN - AOL Transit Data Network GB
24	221.82.58.xxx	12	17676	GIGAINFRA Softbank BB Corp. JP
25	167.205.22.xxx	12	4796	BANDUNG-NET-AS-AP Institute of Technology Bandung ID

Different Country Stalkers

Rank	IP Address	Count	AS	AS Name
1	119.147.146.xxx	7,001	4134	CHINANET-BACKBONE No.31,Jin-rong Street CN
2	8.35.201.xxx	156	15169	GOOGLE - Google Inc. US
3	190.216.130.xxx	84	3549	GBLX Global Crossing Ltd. AR
4	190.27.253.xxx	82	19429	ETB - Colombia CO
5	61.92.16.xxx	62	9269	HKBN-AS-AP Hong Kong Broadband Network Ltd. HK
6	208.80.194.xxx	53	13448	WEBSense Websense, Inc. US
7	112.140.187.xxx	33	45634	SPARKSTATION-SG-AP 10 Science Park Road SG
8	69.41.14.xxx	32	47018	CE-BGPAC - Covenant Eyes, Inc. US
9	126.117.225.xxx	31	17676	GIGAINFRA Softbank BB Corp. JP
10	112.42.175.xxx	20	17506	UICOM UICOM Corp. JP

[Create account](#)  [Log in](#)



WIKIPEDIA
The Free Encyclopedia

- [Main page](#)
- [Contents](#)
- [Featured content](#)
- [Current events](#)
- [Random article](#)
- [Donate to Wikipedia](#)

Article [Talk](#)

[Read](#)

[Edit](#)

[View history](#)



Smoking gun

From Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

For other uses, see [Smoking Gun](#).

The term "**smoking gun**" was originally, and is still primarily, a reference to an object or fact that serves as conclusive [evidence](#) of a [crime](#) or similar act. In addition to this, its meaning has evolved in uses completely unrelated to criminal activity: for example, scientific evidence that is highly suggestive in favor of a particular hypothesis is sometimes called smoking gun evidence. Its name originally came from the idea of finding a smoking (i.e., very recently fired) gun on the person of a suspect wanted for shooting someone, which in that situation would be nearly unshakable proof of having committed the crime. A piece of evidence that falls just short of being conclusive is sometimes referred to as a "smoldering gun."

Lets zoom in for a second

And look at the distribution of the clients who were stalked by 119.147.146.xxx

Which countries were the clients located?

Rank	Count	Country	EC	8	Ecuador	MD	2	Republic of Moldova
AE	27	United Arab Emirates	EG	22	Egypt	ME	7	Montenegro
AG	2	Antigua and Barbuda	ES	38	Spain	MK	69	Macedonia
AL	32	Albania	FR	68	France	MM	2	Myanmar
AM	13	Armenia	GB	45	United Kingdom	MN	36	Mongolia
AR	19	Argentina	GE	12	Georgia	MO	37	Macao
AT	5	Austria	GR	25	Greece	MP	4	Northern Mariana Islands
AU	21	Australia	GY	1	Guyana	MT	4	Malta
AW	6	Aruba	HK	721	Hong Kong	MU	7	Mauritius
AZ	8	Azerbaijan	HN	1	Honduras	MX	107	Mexico
BA	27	Bosnia and Herzegovina	HR	9	Croatia	MY	375	Malaysia
BD	1	Bangladesh	HU	67	Hungary	NC	1	New Caledonia
BE	10	Belgium	ID	159	Indonesia	NI	1	Nicaragua
BG	45	Bulgaria	IE	16	Ireland	NL	15	Netherlands
BN	1	Brunei Darussalam	IL	8	Israel	NO	8	Norway
BO	1	Bolivia	IN	32	India	NP	1	Nepal
BR	44	Brazil	IQ	21	Iraq	NZ	20	New Zealand
BS	1	Bahamas	IT	52	Italy	OM	1	Oman
BY	7	Belarus	JM	5	Jamaica	PA	11	Panama
BZ	4	Belize	JO	2	Jordan	PE	29	Peru
CA	125	Canada	JP	2,910	Japan	PH	166	Philippines
CL	13	Chile	KE	1	Kenya	PK	1	Pakistan
CN	4,622	China	KG	1	Kyrgyzstan	PL	340	Poland
CO	11	Colombia	KH	28	Cambodia	PR	7	Puerto Rico
CR	1	Costa Rica	KR	27	Republic of Korea	PS	9	Occupied Palestinian Territory
CW	2	Curaçao	KW	1	Kuwait	PT	1	Portugal
CY	1	Cyprus	KZ	11	Kazakhstan	RO	197	Romania
CZ	37	Czech Republic	LA	6	Laos	RS	62	Serbia
DE	21	Germany	LK	11	Sri Lanka	RU	32	Russian Federation
DO	2	Dominican Republic	LT	12	Lithuania	RW	1	Rwanda
DZ	19	Algeria	LV	6	Latvia	SA	24	Saudi Arabia
			MA	6	Morocco	SE	3	Sweden
						SG	83	Singapore
						SI	13	Slovenia
						SK	13	Slovakia
						SR	2	Suriname

SV	3	El Salvador
TH	138	Thailand
TN	3	Tunisia
TR	57	Turkey
TW	1,241	Taiwan
UA	37	Ukraine
US	371	United States of America
UZ	1	Uzbekistan
VC	1	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines
VE	16	Venezuela
VN	249	Vietnam
YE	1	Yemen

What the...?

- That's an impressive list of countries!
- And our collection of 30 million URLs across 49 days is a mere drop in the ocean of web fetches on the Internet
- So are we glimpsing here the tip of some much larger program of URL stalking?

Accident? Deliberate? Something Else?

- Why go to all the trouble to collect URLs but use the same IP address to perform the followup stalking?
- Is this some kind of deliberate leakage from a middleware device?
- Or the result of some kind of a virus?
- Or the outcome of TOR + virus?
- Or a smart, but at the same time remarkably dumb, digital stalking program?
- Or *<insert your favourite conspiracy theory here>*